

17 May 2023

Mr. Himanshu Mehta, P.E.
Managing Director
Solid Waste Disposal District
Indian River County
1325 74th Avenue Southwest
Vero Beach, Florida 32968

Subject: Bid Evaluation
Phase 1 - Cell 3 Site Preparation for Class 1 Landfill Segment 3 Expansion
Indian River County Landfill Facility
Vero Beach, Florida

Dear Mr. Mehta:

Geosyntec Consultants, Inc. (Geosyntec) prepared this letter to provide Indian River County (IRC) Solid Waste Disposal District (SWDD) the results of an evaluation of the contractor bids for the Phase 1 construction of Cell 3 of Segment 3 Expansion of the Class 1 Landfill (hereafter referred to as the Project) at the IRC Landfill (IRCL) facility located in Vero Beach, Florida. The bid evaluation is a step in the procurement process undertaken by the SWDD to select the most cost-effective contractor for the Project, and was requested by Mr. Himanshu Mehta, P.E., Managing Director of SWDD. The remainder of this letter presents: (i) project background; (ii) bid process; (iii) summary and evaluation of bids; and (iv) recommendations.

PROJECT BACKGROUND

On 22 November 2022, the SWDD Board authorized Geosyntec through Work Order No. 18 for engineering services for the procurement of a construction contract and development of Engineer's Cost Estimate (ECE) for the Project. The Phase 1 construction project is for the site preparation activities consisting primarily of the earthwork for construction of the subgrade for Cell 3; the fill material will be obtained from off-site borrow sources with the actual placement and compaction to be performed by a contractor through the procurement process. The scope of work for the construction contract also includes abandonment of the perimeter ditch east of Cell 2 and construction of new perimeter ditches around Cells 3 and 4 footprints to tie into the existing ditch south of Cells 1 and 2 footprints.

Geosyntec subsequently completed the preparation of the bid documents for the procurement process and the advertisement for the bids which was published in the Treasure Coast

Newspapers (Indian River Press Journal and tcpalm.com) on 31 March 2023. Geosyntec also prepared the ECE for the overall Project for use in comparing the bids received from contractors.

BID PROCESS

A mandatory pre-bid meeting was held at the IRC facility on 12 April 2023 at 11:30 a.m. which was attended by eleven potential bidders or contractors. Geosyntec provided assistance by describing the scope of work and details of the construction project, answered questions that were raised by the attendees, and accompanied them on a tour of the construction area. Geosyntec also provided technical support to SWDD during the bid process by issuing addenda in response to bidder's questions. A total of two addenda were issued during the process.

On 5 May 2023 the following three general contractors submitted their bids for the Project:

- Comanco Environmental Corporation (Comanco) of Plant City, Florida;
- Ryan Incorporated Southern (Ryan) of Deerfield Beach, Florida; and
- Thalle Construction Co, Inc. (Thalle) of Hillsborough, North Carolina.

It should be noted that the three firms listed above are well known general contractors for landfill and other earthwork construction projects in Florida and the Southeast USA. In particular, Comanco completed Phase 2 Cell 1 of Segment 3 Expansion construction project in 2012-2013; while Thalle completed Cell 2 of Segment 3 Expansion and closure construction project in 2018-2020. Geosyntec has also worked with most of these firms on similar projects in Florida and the Southeast USA.

SUMMARY AND EVALUATION OF BIDS

SWDD and the Purchasing Department initially reviewed the three bids for completeness and accuracy and requested Geosyntec to review the three bids and provide a recommendation to SWDD on the cost proposals. Once again, the three bids that were reviewed came from Comanco, Ryan, and Thalle. Our evaluation presented herein is based solely on the copies of the completed bid forms received from SWDD.

Geosyntec utilized the bidder's completed forms to prepare the Summary of Bids table presented in Attachment A. The table shows that the total for the Base bids are: (i) \$6,141,000.00 for Comanco; (ii) \$5,848,249.00 for Ryan (note that Ryan's total was corrected for a typo); and (iii) \$10,585,750.00 for Thalle. Note that the Base Bid includes a 15% contingency. When the Optional Bid for Cell 4 Site Preparation is added then the total (Base + Optional) bids are (i) \$8,974,300.00 for Comanco; (ii) \$8,203,569.10 for Ryan; and (iii) \$14,863,500.00 for Thalle. These totals include the 15% contingency from the Base Bid.

Therefore, the lowest bid is from Ryan in the amount of \$5,848,249.00 for the Base Bid and \$8,203,569.10 for the Total (Base + Optional) Bid. A more detailed analysis of the three bids relative to the ECE of \$5,683,252.00 for the Base Bid and \$7,957,501.70 for the Total (Base + Optional) Bid is also presented in Attachment A. In general, the unit costs from two of three bidders significantly resembled the ECE with a small exceedance (3% for Ryan and 8 to 13% for Comanco). Significant or more than 30% exceedances were only observed in the following bid items: mobilization, site preparation and geotextile separator. As for Thalle, the unit rates were significantly high when compared to both Geosyntec ECE and the two other bids submitted hereby.

Although the ECE was exceeded by less than 15% for Ryan's and Comanco's bids, the above differences between the Contractors' bids and the ECE reflect the "Uncertainties in Cost Estimation" for any construction projects in general. Off-site fill material unit costs were based on estimates provided by other contractors with the assumption that the materials would be readily available in close proximity to the site (e.g., the borrow pit across the site west of I-95). It appears that these materials may not be available there and the bidders have included fuel costs in their bids. Similarly, the geotextile separator rolls and stabilizer material are also sensitive to fuel prices.

It should also be noted the 15% contingency adds \$762,815.00 to the bids submitted by Ryan. This contingency amount may not be utilized completely during construction.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the review and evaluation presented above, Geosyntec recommends Ryan as the top bidder with lowest total cost to undertake construction activities required for the Site Preparation for Cell 3 of Segment 3 Expansion. SWDD may decide not to exercise the Optional Bid. In that case, the exceedance for the total cost without the contingency would be \$143,476.00, which can be funded by the contingency amount estimated by Geosyntec (\$741,294.00) in the ECE.

Mr. Himanshu Mehta, P.E.
17 May 2023
Page 4

CLOSURE

Geosyntec appreciates the opportunity to provide services to Indian River County. If you have any questions regarding this correspondence, please feel free to contact either of the undersigned at 904-450-4259.

Sincerely,



Ritaja Ray, Ph.D.
Senior Staff Professional



Kwasi Badu-Tweneboah, Ph.D., P.E.
Senior Principal

ATTACHMENT A

SUMMARY OF BIDS TABLE

BID FORM - BID NO. 2023040
SOLID WASTE DISPOSAL DISTRICT
INDIAN RIVER COUNTY LANDFILL
PHASE 1 - CELL 3 SITE PREPARATION

				Geosyntec Consultants		Commanco			Ryan Companies, Inc			Thalle Construction Co			
Item No.	Work Description/Item	Units	Estimated Quantity (Note X)	Unit Cost (Material + Labor)	Total Cost	Material/ Labor Unit Cost	Total Cost	% Difference	Material/ Labor Unit Cost	Total Cost	% Difference	Material/ Labor Unit Cost	Total Cost	% Difference	
BASE BID - Cell 3 Site Preparation															
General Site Preparation															
1	Mobilization and Demobilization (See Note I)	LS	1	\$100,000	\$100,000	\$326,016	\$326,016	226%	\$82,200	\$82,200		\$895,000	\$895,000	795%	
2	Surveying (See Note II)	LS	1	\$30,000	\$30,000	\$20,000	\$20,000		\$37,700	\$37,700	26%	\$13,000	\$13,000		
3	Site Preparation (See Note III)	acre	21	\$2,500	\$52,500	\$1,450	\$30,450		\$3,600	\$75,600	44%	\$8,500	\$178,500	240%	
4	Erosion and Sediment Controls	LS	1	\$97,193	\$97,193	\$15,000	\$15,000		\$34,100	\$34,100		\$70,000	\$70,000		
Phase I Cell 3 Preparation															
5	Earthwork (General Fill) (See Note IV)														
	A	Grading for Cell 3 (Fill) & Perimeter Berm (Fill) & backfilling north-south perimeter ditch between Cell 2(existing)	CY	189,700	\$17.50	\$3,319,750	\$19.00	\$3,604,300	9%	\$18.40	\$3,490,480	5%	\$28.75	\$5,453,875	64%
	B	Perimeter Berm, Ditch & Access Road	CY	62,250	\$17.50	\$1,089,375	\$19.50	\$1,213,875	11%	\$19.20	\$1,195,200	10%	\$38.50	\$2,396,625	120%
Roads															
6	Perimeter Access Road														
	A	8" Stabilizer Material	CY	1100	\$80.00	\$88,000	\$42.50	\$46,750		\$29.00	\$31,900		\$90.00	\$99,000	13%
	B	Geotextile Separator (See Note V)	SY	4840	\$3.50	\$16,940	\$4.32	\$20,909	23%	\$5.60	\$27,104	60%	\$7.50	\$36,300	114%
Vegetation/Permanent Stabilization															
7	Sodding bottom and sideslopes of the perimeter	acre	5.7	\$26,000.00	\$148,200	\$11,000	\$62,700		\$19,500	\$111,150		\$11,000	\$62,700		
Sum of lines 1 through 7					\$4,941,958		\$5,340,000	8%		\$5,085,434	3%		\$9,205,000	86%	
Contingency (15% of Items 1 through 7)					\$741,294		\$801,000	8%		\$762,815	3%		\$1,380,750	86%	
BASE BID TOTAL COST					\$5,683,252		\$6,141,000	8%		\$5,848,249	3%		\$10,585,750	86%	
=															
OPTIONAL BID - Cell 4 Site Preparation (See Note VI)															
General Site Preparation															
8	Site Preparation (See Note VII)	acre	8	2,000	\$16,000	\$1,500	\$12,000		\$1,830	\$14,640		\$14,000	\$112,000	600%	
9	Additional Surveying (See Note VIII)	LS	1	20,000	\$20,000	\$7,500	\$7,500		\$12,900	\$12,900		\$9,000	\$9,000		
Phase I Cell 4 Preparation															
10	Earthwork (General Fill)														
		Grading for Cell 4 (Fill) & Perimeter Berm (Fill) (See Note IX)	CY	127,900	18	\$2,238,250	\$22.00	\$2,813,800	26%	\$18.20	\$2,327,780	4%	\$32.50	\$4,156,750	86%
	Sum of lines 8 through 10					\$2,274,250		\$2,833,300	25%		\$2,355,320	4%		\$4,277,750	88%
OPTIONAL BID TOTAL COST					\$2,274,250		\$2,833,300	25%		\$2,355,320	4%		\$4,277,750	88%	
=															
GRAND TOTAL (BASE + OPTIONAL BIDS)					\$7,957,501.70		\$8,974,300.00	13%		\$8,203,569.10	3%		\$14,863,500.00	87%	

= Contractor's estimate is 10 to 30% higher than the Engineer's estimate
 = Contractor's estimate is more than 30% of the Engineer's estimate.
 = Does not match Contractor's Bid Form Subtotal (wrong math)

**BID FORM - BID NO. 2023040
SOLID WASTE DISPOSAL DISTRICT
INDIAN RIVER COUNTY LANDFILL
PHASE 1 - CELL 3 SITE PREPARATION**

Notes

- I. Mobilization/Demobilization shall include and cover the furnishing of all materials, labor, tools, and equipment necessary for the Contractor to mobilize the necessary operations to the project site, and shall also cover demobilizing all material, labor, tools, personal and equipment from the project site. This item shall be in accordance with 'Section 01025: Measurement and Payment 1.03A'
- II. The survey activities (Item 2) shall include initial and all surveying necessary throughout the duration of the project.
- III. The Site Preparation activities (Item 3) shall include clearing, grubbing, stripping, and surface grading and shall be in accordance with Section 02110 of the Specifications.
- IV. Earthwork involves grading for Cell 3 extending 50 ft into future Cell 4 from south to north; filling for perimeter berms to tie in to Cell 2 subgrade elevations along the north, south and east boundaries ; cutting as required, in accordance with the existing topography, for the perimeter ditch. Quantities are based on in-plane volume.
- V The geotextile separator shall be a multi-filament woven geotextile and shall be in accordance with the technical specifications.
- VI Future Cell 4 subgrade preparation will be an option to perform at the discretion of owner. Mark Optional Bid items as NA if not applicable.
- VII The Site Preparation activities (Item 9) for Cell 4 shall include clearing, grubbing, stripping, and surface grading and shall be in accordance with Section 02110 of the Specifications.
- VIII Additional Survey (item 10) shall include initial and all surveying necessary for Cell 4 site preparation.
- IX Earthwork involves grading for Cell 4 from south to north; Quantities are based on in-plane volume. filling for perimeter berms all along the north, south and east boundaries; cutting as required, in accordance with the existing topography.
- X Quantities presented herein are estimated quantities and should be verified by Contractor. If quantities are found to be significantly different, Contractor shall notify Construction Manager. Quantities not provided shall be estimated and verified by Contractor. Payment shall be made on surveyed and calculated quantities in accordance with the Technical Specifications.