



# Indian River County Florida

## Draft Meeting Minutes

### Board of County Commissioners

Indian River County  
Administration Complex  
1801 27th Street, Building  
A  
Vero Beach, Florida,  
32960-3388  
www.indianriver.gov

*Joseph H. Earman, District 3, Chairman*

*Susan Adams, District 1, Vice Chairman*

*Joseph Flescher, District 2*

*Deryl Loar, District 4*

*Laura Moss, District 5*

**John A. Titkanich, Jr., County Administrator**

**William K. DeBraal, County Attorney**

**Ryan L. Butler, Clerk of the Circuit Court and Comptroller**

**Shauna James, Deputy Clerk**

---

Tuesday, November 7, 2023

9:00 AM

Commission Chambers

---

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER

**Present:** 5 - Chairman Joe Earman  
Vice Chairman Susan Adams  
Commissioner Joseph Flescher  
Commissioner Deryl Loar  
Commissioner Laura Moss

#### 2.A. A MOMENT OF SILENT REFLECTION FOR FIRST RESPONDERS AND MEMBERS OF THE ARMED FORCES

#### 2.B. INVOCATION

**Deacon Wilfred Hart, Friendship Missionary Baptist Church**

#### 3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

**Commissioner Deryl Loar**

#### 4. ADDITIONS/DELETIONS TO THE AGENDA / EMERGENCY ITEMS

Moved: Item 15.B.4 after the Consent Agenda

Moved: Item 15.B.5 after Item 7.E..

**A motion was made by Vice Chairman Adams, seconded by Commissioner Flescher, to approve the Agenda as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

#### 5. PROCLAMATIONS and PRESENTATIONS

**5.A.** Presentation of Proclamation Dedicating November 13th - 19th as National Apprenticeship Week

Colleen Gill, Apprenticeship Navigator for Career Source Treasure Coast, thanked the Board for recognizing National Apprenticeship Week. The program connects employers and job seekers to provide free on-the-job training, and helps reduce turnover rates, increases productivity, lowers recruitment costs, and ensures job site safety.

**Read and presented by Commissioner Flescher**

**5.B.** Presentation of Proclamation Recognizing the Week of November 15 - 22, 2023 as Farm-City Week

Gracee Hendrix, Board Member of the Indian River County Farm Bureau, expressed her gratitude for the Board's unwavering support and contributions to the Farm Bureau in Indian River County. She mentioned that the County's participation in the Farm City Week event, which promoted positive relationships between farm families and city residents of Indian River County, was invaluable. Furthermore, she appreciated the County's support for the farmers in the community.

**Read and presented by Vice Chairman Adams**

**6. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**7. INFORMATION ITEMS FROM STAFF OR COMMISSIONERS NOT REQUIRING BOARD ACTION**

**7.A.** SWDD Closures and Collection Service Changes for Thanksgiving

**No Action Taken or Required**

**7.B.** Indian River County Venue Event Calendar Review

**No Action Taken or Required**

**7.C.** Notice of Extension to Contract for Construction of Required Roadway Improvements (Re: Right-Of-Way Permit No. 2021091000) - Restoration (Removal of Temporary Construction Entrance) - Project: The Vivien Apartments, City of Vero Beach - Developer: Park Pointe Apartments Vero, LLC

**No Action Taken or Required**

**7.D.** Notice of Extension to Contract for Construction of Required Roadway Improvements (Re: Right-Of-Way Permit No. 2021091000) - 41st St. North Canal Widening Improvements - Project: The Vivien Apartments, City of Vero Beach - Developer: Park Pointe Apartments Vero, LLC

**No Action Taken or Required**

**7.E.** Operation Green Light

Colonel Anthony "Tony" Young from Operation Green Light displayed a photograph of the green light home on 2204 Vero Beach Avenue. He thanked the Board for bringing attention to the Veterans and their contributions.

Commissioner Flescher praised Deputy County Administrator Mike Zito and Director of Parks and Recreation Beth Powell for their dedicated efforts toward launching Operation Green Light. Mr. Zito stated that various county-owned buildings, including the Fairgrounds, Administration Buildings, and the Intergenerational (iG) Center, would be lit up in green as a tribute to Operation Green Light. He expressed gratitude to the Board for their hard work in collecting donations for the project, as all the lights had been donated and installed by the Parks and Recreation Department and the Facilities team.

**No Action Taken or Required**

## 8. CONSENT AGENDA

**A motion was made by Vice Chairman Adams, seconded by Commissioner Flescher, to approve the Consent Agenda as amended, pulling Item 8.N. for discussion. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

**8.A.** Checks and Electronic Payments September 15, 2023 to September 21, 2023

**Approved**

**8.B.** Checks and Electronic Payments September 22, 2023 to September 28, 2023

**Approved**

**8.C.** Checks and Electronic Payments September 29, 2023 to October 5, 2023

**Approved**

**8.D.** Checks and Electronic Payments October 6, 2023 to October 12, 2023

**Approved**

**8.E.** Checks and Electronic Payments October 13, 2023 to October 19, 2023

**Approved**

**8.F.** Checks and Electronic Payments October 20, 2023 to October 26, 2023

**Approved**

- 8.G.** Award of RFP 2024005 Comprehensive Utility Rate Study  
**Approved staff's recommendation**
- 8.H.** Second Amendment to Agreement for Vending Machine Services (Bid 2019030)  
**Approved staff's recommendation**
- 8.I.** Agreement with Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc. for Continuing Environmental, Ecological, and Biological Support Services  
**Approved staff's recommendation**
- 8.J.** Award of Bid 2024009 for Jones' Pier Conservation Area Bungalow Renovation  
**Approved staff's recommendation**
- 8.K.** Miscellaneous Budget Amendment 09  
**Approved staff's recommendation and Resolution 2023-071, amending the fiscal year 2022-2023 budget.**
- 8.L.** IRL Council Small Grant Contract#: 2023SG-09  
**Approved staff's recommendation**
- 8.M.** Award of RFP 2024008 for Agent/Brokers, Self-Insurance Fund and Direct Writing Insurers for Property and Casualty Insurance  
**Approved staff's recommendation**
- 8.N.** Approval of the Affordable Housing Advisory Committee 2023 Incentives Review and Recommendation Report Resolution
- Vice Chairman Adams emphasized that the County had consistently received many inquiries from other regions within the state regarding the existing incentives package in an attempt to replicate some of the successful initiatives of the Affordable Housing Advisory Committee (AHAC). This was a positive indication that AHAC had effectively implemented its affordable housing program in Indian River County.
- Chief Planner Chris Balter stated that other areas in the state were considering adopting the impact fee waiver program as an incentive. Since 1992, this program had spent \$22.5 million, generated \$8.6 million in income, and helped many people, including 27 families this year alone. The program had also been beneficial to Habitat for Humanity, enabling them to keep housing prices affordable. Mr. Balter commended his staff for their outstanding work in processing applications quickly and efficiently.
- Vice Chairman Adams stated the implementation of software would enable staff to

move through the State Housing Initiative Partnership Program (SHIP) applications faster and more efficiently. She thanked staff for all their hard work.

**A motion was made by Vice Chairman Adams, seconded by Commissioner Flescher, to approve staff's recommendation and Resolution 2023-072, approving the Indian River County Affordable Housing Advisory Committee (AHAC) 2023 report and directing staff to submit the County's Local Housing Assistance Plan to Florida Housing Finance Corporation (FHFC). The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

**8.O.** AtkinsRéalis USA Work Order 3 for Supplemental Staff Support Services

**Approved staff's recommendation**

**8.P.** Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc. Work Order 6 Amendment 1, Oslo Water Treatment Plant Improvements, Construction Phase Services

**Approved staff's recommendation**

**8.Q.** Release of Retainage - Bid No. 2023035 - Exterior Painting at Indian River County Courthouse

**Approved staff's recommendation**

**8.R.** Acceptance and Approval of Modification #2 of Emergency Management Program Grant (EMPG) Federally-Funded Subgrant Agreement; Agreement Number: G0371

**Approved staff's recommendation**

## **9. CONSTITUTIONAL OFFICERS and GOVERNMENTAL AGENCIES**

### **10. PUBLIC ITEMS**

#### **A. PUBLIC HEARINGS**

#### **B. PUBLIC DISCUSSION ITEMS**

**10.B.1.** Request for Public Discussion by Mr. Doug DeMuth re: City of Vero Beach Wastewater Treatment Plant Cost

Mr. Douglas DeMuth, a resident, requested an urgent review of the water and wastewater rates based on the City of Vero Beach's new wastewater plant costs. The request was made for the unincorporated Indian River County residents who received services from the City. Additionally, Mr. DeMuth urged the Board to implement a limit on any increase in rates for these residents over the next five years. He utilized a PowerPoint presentation to present his case before the Board.

There was no further discussion from the Board.

**No Action Taken or Required**

**C. PUBLIC NOTICE ITEMS**

**11. COUNTY ADMINISTRATOR MATTERS**

The Chairman called a recess at 10:10 a.m., and reconvened the meeting at 10:19 a.m., with all members present.

**11.A. WWII Tribute - Request for County Funding**

County Administrator John Titkanich stated that the World War II Tribute Team was creating a permanent stage at the Veterans Memorial Island Sanctuary to honor the 42 Indian River County residents who lost their lives during the war and those who served. The request was \$33,750 for 26 helical piers to support the structure.

Colonel Tony Young displayed the image of the memorial as he reflected on stories of the men and women who had lost their lives in World War II. He was joined by family members of military personnel who had served in the war. He thanked the Board for supporting the Veterans of Indian River County. He stated that the Indian River Historical Society had partnered with Cultural Council of Indian River County and other veteran, community, and private groups and foundations to fund a historical marker that would be placed on the kiosk. The marker would feature a QR code that links to a video that was currently in production.

Commissioner Moss stated this was a true tribute to the veterans. Commissioner Flescher was thoroughly impressed with the amount of fundraising and outreach to the community that took place to get this mission accomplished.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Moss, seconded by Commissioner Flescher, to approve the funding amount of \$33,750 for 26 helical piers to support the World War II Tribute. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

**12. DEPARTMENTAL MATTERS**

**A. Community Services**

**B. Emergency Services**

**C. Human Resources**

## D. Information Technology

## E. Natural Resources

### 12.E.1

#### Sector 3 Hurricanes Ian and Nicole Dune Renourishment Project

Interim Natural Resources Director Eric Charest utilized a PowerPoint presentation to detail the construction contract with Dickerson Infrastructure, Inc. for the Sector 3 Hurricanes Ian and Nicole Dune Restoration Project. The project aimed to restore 6.6 miles of coastline in North Beach, Orchid Town, Wabasso Beach, Indian River Shores, and unincorporated Indian River County. It would involve placing beach-compatible sand and native dune plants from the Seaview subdivision to the south of Turtle Trail beach access. Construction would occur approximately between November 1st and April 30th to avoid turtle nesting season. The project would place 274,368 cubic yards of sand fill and install 728,633 native dune plants along the shoreline at a cost of \$13,078,244.36.

Commissioner Flescher entered into discussion with Mr. Charest and Coastal Resource Manager Quintin Bergman about the sea turtle nesting season. They confirmed that the beach renourishment project took into account the protection of sea turtles and their nests and none of the turtles or their nests would be harmed during this project.

Resident Mr. Will Ferrell thanked the Board and everyone involved in these projects, stating that every Barrier Island resident was grateful for their hard work.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Flescher, seconded by Commissioner Moss, to approve staff's recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

### 12.E.2.

#### Sector 3, Hurricanes Ian and Nicole Dune Renourishment Construction Administration, APTIM Work Order No. 2018006-17

Eric Charest, Interim Natural Resources Director, utilized a PowerPoint presentation to detail the construction activities undertaken in the Sector 3 Hurricanes Ian and Nicole Dune Renourishment project. This project had several permit requirements that must be strictly adhered to, including the recently approved contract with Dickerson Infrastructure, Inc. to undertake this project. A proposed Work Order had been put forward by Aptim Environmental and Infrastructure, LLC (APTIM) for professional engineering services to support construction administration and monitoring during the Sector 3 Hurricanes Ian and Nicole Dune Renourishment Project construction. The total amount for Sector 3

Dune Repair Construction Administration would be \$504,685.96.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Flescher, seconded by Commissioner Moss, to approve staff's recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

## **F. Office of Management and Budget**

## **G. Parks, Recreation, and Conservation**

## **H. Planning and Development Services**

### **12.H.1.**

#### Revision to SHARP Program Funding Schedule

Andy Sobczak, Planning and Development Services Director, presented the revision to the Supplemental Housing Assistance Rehab and Purchase (SHARP) program. He stated on October 25, 2023, the Affordable Housing Advisory Committee (AHAC) voted unanimously to approve the proposed SHARP funding changes.

In March 2022, the County approved the SHARP program, which combines the State Housing Initiatives Partnership (SHIP) program with the American Rescue Plan (ARP) funds. This program aimed to increase the overall limit of available funds, which was used to provide homes by either renovating existing homes or building new ones. During the presentation, a chart was displayed showing the changes which would double the available funding.

Vice Chairman Adams remarked that the AHAC was excited to repurpose the ARP dollars to provide more financial support. She mentioned that for a median-income family, the program could offer up to \$40,000 in purchase assistance, which could be increased with additional funds for home rehabilitation. With the current housing prices in the community, this program could go a long way, and the committee was grateful to have found a way to reallocate the funds and make them more accessible to those in need.

Commissioner Moss inquired about the status of the funding cap of \$400,000 approved by the Board in December of 2022, for the low-income housing tax credit program, and if it was still reserved for the ARP. Mr. Sobczak confirmed that the amount available for the program was \$340,000 and that it was still part of the allocation of the ARP.

Additional discussion ensued between the Commissioners and staff regarding the revised funding for the SHARP program and forthcoming projects.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Moss, seconded by Commissioner Flescher, to approve the proposed changes to the Supplemental Housing Assistance Rehab and Purchase (SHARP) program funding schedule. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

## 12.H.2.

Federal Transit Administration FY 2023 Triennial Review Final Report

Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) Staff Director Brian Freeman utilized a PowerPoint presentation to show the final report of the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) FY 2023 triennial review. He highlighted that 2023 had been a phenomenal year for transit in Indian River County.

He stated the GoLine had seen an all-time record of 1,261,480 ridership for the fiscal year that just ended. There were more riders than before the pandemic, making the GoLine one of the few transit systems in the country that can make that boast. The GoLine was also the most cost-efficient system in Florida. The triennial review was the FTA's primary method of providing oversight to transit agencies receiving federal funding.

Mr. Freeman stated it was a long and arduous process that took several months to complete. Countless hours were spent compiling all the documents required by the FTA and their reviewers. The process was conducted through several virtual meetings that lasted several months. It culminated in a two-day in-person site visit that was incredibly intense. The training review program was very comprehensive, covering 23 different areas. They examined legal and financial capacity, technical capacity, maintenance program and procedures, procurement records, and compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA).

The FTA released the final report for the triennial review, which included a chart displaying the number of findings or deficiencies identified during previous reviews. He stated the MPO would typically have 3 to 5 minor issues requiring adjustments or corrections. However, this year, the MPO was thrilled to report that there were zero findings. This was a testament to the strong partnership with the Senior Resource Association (SRA) and their commitment to providing an efficient and effective system while upholding best practices.

Andy Sobczak, Planning and Development Services Director, praised the MPO staff for their outstanding performance. He said the coordination with the SRA was excellent, and the group was exceptionally well-run. Mr. Sobczak believed their success resulted from their hard work and dedication to doing everything right. He concluded by congratulating the team on a job well done.

Karen Deigl, President and CEO of Senior Resource Association, collaborated with the MPO and expressed her appreciation for the staff who worked diligently on the triennial review. The review was an accumulation of work done over the years and required meticulous attention to detail. It was crucial to ensure that everything was done perfectly. She commented the team put in a lot of effort to produce an excellent review.

**No Action Taken or Required**

**I. Public Works**

**J. Utilities Services**

**13. COUNTY ATTORNEY MATTERS**

**14. COMMISSIONERS MATTERS**

**A. Commissioner Joseph H. Earman, Chairman**

**B. Commissioner Susan Adams, Vice Chairman**

**C. Commissioner Joseph E. Flescher**

**D. Commissioner Deryl Loar**

**E. Commissioner Laura Moss**

**15. SPECIAL DISTRICTS AND BOARDS**

**A. Emergency Services District**

The Board of County Commissioners reconvened as the Board of Commissioners of the Solid Waste Disposal District. The minutes will be approved at an upcoming Solid Waste Disposal District meeting.

**B. Solid Waste Disposal District**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Flescher, seconded by Vice Chairman Adams, to approve the Solid Waste Disposal District Preliminary Budget Meeting Minutes of September 13, 2023, and Solid Waste Disposal District Final Budget Meeting Minutes of September 20, 2023 as written. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

**15.B.1.** Approval of SWDD Preliminary Budget Hearing Meeting Minutes of September 13, 2023

**Approved as written**

**15.B.2.** Approval of SWDD Final Budget Hearing Meeting Minutes of September 20, 2023

**Approved as written**

**15.B.3.** Approval of the SWDD Meeting Minutes of October 3, 2023

**A motion was made by Commissioner Flescher, seconded by Commissioner Loar, to approve the Solid Waste Disposal District Meeting Minutes of October 3, 2023 as written. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

*[Clerks note: Item 15.B.4. was heard following the Consent Agenda]*

**15.B.4.** Lease of SWDD Property to Halley Engineering Contractors, Inc. for the Oslo Widening and I-95 Interchange Project

Solid Waste Disposal District Managing Director Himanshu Mehta stated that Halley Engineering Contractors, Inc. (HEC) had requested to use approximately two acres of SWDD property as a laydown/stabilized staging area for their Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT) Oslo widening and I-95 Interchange project. The SWDD property was located on Oslo Road and would provide them with easy access to the project. The lease would be through September 30, 2027, or upon project completion, and the lease amount would be \$600 a month.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Flescher, seconded by Commissioner Loar, to approve staff's recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

*[Clerks note: Item 15.B.5. was heard after Item 7.E.]*

**15.B.5.** Residential Paper Shredding Event on November 18, 2023

Sue Flak, Recycling Education Coordinator, Solid Waste Disposal District stated the upcoming paper shredding event would be held on Saturday, November 18th at Southeast Secure Shredding from 8:00 a.m. to noon. Ms. Flak also stated all five Convenience Centers would be closed on Thanksgiving Day.

**No Action Taken or Required**

**C. Environmental Control Board**

**16. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the Chairman adjourned the meeting at 11:01 A.M.